



January 1995
Volume 39
Number 1

Realization of
a Dream
Charles H. Herty
and the South's
First Newsprint Mill

Germaine M. Reed

Overrun with Bushes
Frontier Land
Development and the
Forest History of the
Holland Purchase, 1800-50

Charles E. Brooks

Deforestation in
Costa Rica
An Examination
of Social and
Historical Factors

Anja Nygren

Forest & Conservation History



Forest & Conservation History

January 1995
Volume 39
Number 1

Articles

- 4 **Realization of a Dream: Charles H. Herty and the South's First Newsprint Mill**, by Germaine M. Reed
- 17 **Overrun with Bushes: Frontier Land Development and the Forest History of the Holland Purchase, 1800-50**, by Charles E. Brooks
- 27 **Deforestation in Costa Rica: An Examination of Social and Historical Factors**, by Anja Nygren

Book Reviews

- 36 **Federal Land, Western Anger: The Sagebrush Rebellion & Environmental Politics**, by R. McGreggor Cawley, reviewed by Charles Coate
- 36 **Green History: A Reader in Environmental Literature, Philosophy and Politics**, by Derek Wall, reviewed by Karl Hess Jr.
- 37 **Commoners: Common Right, Enclosure and Social Change in England, 1700-1820**, by J. M. Neeson, reviewed by Patricia Jasen
- 38 **A Society of Wolves: National Parks and the Battle Over the Wolf**, by Rick McIntyre, **The Timber Wolf in Wisconsin: The Death and Life of a Majestic Predator**, by Richard P. Thiel, and **Meant To Be Wild: The Struggle to Save Endangered Species Through Captive Breeding**, by Jan DeBlieu, reviewed by Elizabeth Atwood Lawrence
- 39 **A Fierce Green Fire: The American Environmental Movement**, by Philip Shabecoff, reviewed by John J. Little
- 40 **Science in the Subarctic: Trappers, Traders, and the Smithsonian Institution**, by Debra Lindsay, reviewed by Michael Hall
- 40 **Claiming the High Ground: Sherpas, Subsistence, and Environmental Change in the Highest Himalaya**, by Stanley F. Stevens, reviewed by Naomi H. Bishop
- 41 **Pan's Travail: Environmental Problems of the Ancient Greeks and Romans**, by J. Donald Hughes, reviewed by Mark A. Lelle
- 42 **The Arkansas Delta: Land of Paradox**, edited by Jeannie Whyne and Willard B. Gatewood, reviewed by John G. Sproat
- 43 **Clearcut: The Tragedy of Industrial Forestry**, edited by Bill Devall, reviewed by Gordon Brent Ingram
- 43 **Natural Resources Policy and Law: Trends and Directions**, edited by Lawrence J. MacDonnell and Sarah F. Bates, reviewed by Ronald H. Rosenberg
- 44 **Great Lakes Lumber on the Great Plains: The Laird, Norton Lumber Company in South Dakota**, by John N. Vogel, reviewed by Wenonah Finch Sharpe
- 45 **John Muir: Life and Work**, edited by Sally M. Miller, reviewed by Kathleen Wadden

46 News

47 Biblioscope

Affiliated with
Duke University Press

Clearcut: The Tragedy of Industrial Forestry. Edited by Bill Devall. San Francisco, California: Sierra Club Books and Earth Island Press, 1993. 291 pp. Photographs. \$50.00.

Before *Clearcut*, a beautifully produced portfolio about environmental degradation would have been considered an oxymoron. In the history of the coffee-table book, this one is a landmark. The beautiful scenes of California that Ansel Adams so carefully manipulated through his camera bellows to produce such books as *This Is the American Earth* set the scene for contemporary environmentalism. Thirty years later the photography is not so pretty and we have been reduced from celebration of region to globalized carnage. But the links to North American romanticism, with all its contradictions, still persist.

Instead of seductive images for tourist consumption, this book captures mauled landscapes. The impact is often overwhelming and regularly disconcerting. This is a well-positioned and well-compiled spectacle. But the imagery of *Clearcut* is also problematic. Almost all the photographs are devoid of people, technologies, and signs of communities. Most of the imagery evokes a sense of isolation and hopelessness, leading to little understanding of the specific nature of the impact particular logging operations might have had. There are only limited clues to help the reader interpret and understand specific relationships the scenes indicate. The text on the side of each photograph provides political rhetoric but very little information on how to interpret the environmental degradation taking place.

Along with these massive images are a number of essays. Chris Maser's introductory essay is focused on the conversion of ancient forests, and essays by Herb Hammond and Reed Noss provide some clear theoretical and conceptual introductions to old-growth processes and biodiversity. But most of the other essays are muddled and rhetorical. The second half of the essays, on alternatives, are no clearer except for a fine outline Hammond wrote on "ecosystem-based" forestry. The essays in *Clearcut* are more about the loss of old-growth forest ecosystems, long on philosophy and short on detail. This causes a schism between imagery and text that contributes to the reader being more appalled but not much better informed. Some of the philosophical ramblings and poems are so preoccupied with interconnectedness and Gaia that they verge on the paranoid. The usage of

"bioregion" is inconsistent. More problematic, the relationship between declining logging communities and cutting of the remaining old-growth forests is hardly explored.

With this reduction in the narrative, the photographs become fetishes—the last word in a case barely made. The images from Canada portray the most massive destruction and are the most graphic. This was probably due partly to reality, partly to availability of photographs, and partly to lack of understanding of the current range of cutting operations. The images in this portfolio, for Vancouver Island as an example, are gruesome particularly in terms of scale and erosion—so bad that they deserve more interpretive text along with the huge pages.

Clearcut is a bit of a tease and a bit of a romp, through a huge topic. Now that the coffee-table book has been done, it is time to bear down on the relationship between photographic imagery and "place" in a way that provides more information and critical perspectives, even when, as here, the photographers and authors have a handle on the truth.

Reviewed by Gordon Brent Ingram. Mr. Ingram is an assistant professor in environmental planning with a partial appointment in the forest resources management department at the University of British Columbia. He has mounted several photographic exhibitions on protected areas, other open space, and environmental degradation.

Natural Resources Policy and Law:

Trends and Directions. Edited by Lawrence J. MacDonnell and Sarah F. Bates. Washington, D.C.: Island Press, 1993. xiv + 241 pp. Notes, index. Cloth \$38.00, paper \$19.95.

This book, a commemoration of the ten-year anniversary of the University of Colorado Natural Resources Law Center's founding, collects ten diverse essays treating the topic of natural resource law and policy. The authors, all distinguished academic commentators, address broad issues of natural resource use and protection. They attempt to predict the future course of affairs in this field. Fortunately for the reader, the authors' prognostications are mixed with a healthy portion of advocacy. This makes reading *Natural Resources Policy and Law* both stimulating and worthwhile. These essays are written in a clear and accessible style, devoid of excessive legal jargon, and are well-suited both for undergraduate and graduate students as well as general readers.

The first essay, "Rethinking Resources: Reflections on a New Generation of Natural Resources Policy and Law," by Lawrence J. MacDonnell and Sarah F. Bates, discusses how new ways of thinking about natural phenomena like rivers, forests, and the atmosphere have transformed the concept of "natural resources." Once considered commodities available for exploitation, these natural features are being considered within their ecological context, connected to other environmental components. MacDonnell and Bates stress the need for adopting public policies based on integrated natural resource concepts, replacing the "exploitation ethic" with an ethic of sustainable use.

In the second essay, "Natural Resources Law: An Historical Perspective," Clyde O. Martz describes the historical pattern of natural resource policies that encouraged private development of timber, water, minerals, and grazing lands. Martz argues that developments in environmental law during the last twenty-five years stifled needed resource and related economic development. His essay stands out in this collection as a call to view earlier natural resource policy as the beacon to which modern society should return.

George C. Coggins weighs in with an essay on "Trends in Public Land Law (A Title the Inaccuracy of Which Should Become Manifest)." This essay is in striking contrast to Martz. It too describes the evolution of public natural resources law yet it finds current shortcomings to be "simply the residue of more or less ad hoc developments over two centuries" (p. 51). Coggins concludes his section with predictions of future trends in public natural resources law. Among his predictions are that both multiple use management and the prior appropriation doctrine of water allocation are doomed because "both prior appropriation and multiple use are constructs of an age that is now irrevocably over, and both fit very poorly with modern management imperatives and priorities" (p. 59).

Lawrence J. MacDonnell has written an essay entitled "Mineral Law in the United States: A Study in Legal Change." In his view, the legal changes he discusses reveal increased significance of land and other resource values and at the same time decreased importance in American mineral development. An example of this point is made in the context of the constitutional regulatory "taking" issue, which MacDonnell believes has shifted toward upholding significant government restrictions on mining.